

Appendix A - Comparison of Expected Benefits and Interview Responses

Mod No.	Modification Name	Change	Cost	Benefit	Answer 1	Answer 2	Answer 3
SECMP 0062 Nov 2020	Northbound Application Traffic Management & Alert Storm Protection	To provide Alert Storm protection through a DCC designed mechanism which will count the number of Alerts originating from a specific Device within a defined time window. If the Device sends the same Alert above a pre-determined threshold value, the mechanism will discard excess Alerts from the Device and only forward one copy of that Alert in a designated period agreed by the DCC on to the intended Users.	£1,088,392	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Useful but difficult to quantify. It was electricity benefit only.	Did not have to keep checking databases were full so useful in cutting down the noise - could not provide value	-
MP080 Nov 2020	Managing DUIS uplifts	To include all existing and future DUIS versions in SEC Schedule 11 'Technical Specification Applicability Table' (TSAT). By allowing these versions to be end dated, it will allow the DCC to manage fewer versions of	£0	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Only suppliers could potentially have a direct financial impact	-	-



		the DUIS and, in the long term, reduce testing costs.					
MP093 Nov 2020	Implementing IRP511 and CRP535 to support GBCS v3.2 devices	IRP511 'Set Clock Alerts Refs in Alert Tables Incorrect' which introduces the Set Clock Alert 0x81C6 to the Event log to allow Users to identify the need for Home Area Network (HAN) Device fault correction. CRP535 'Restoring Removed Devices from the HAN' which allows Users to use Service Request SR8.9 'Read Device Log' to read the Communications Hub Function (CHF) device log. The log contains the active and historical Device which allows Users to know which historical Device has been removed from the HAN so that it could be restored if required.	£245,000	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	If it had been implemented under the Secretary of State process there would have been no costs. Issue was caused by lack of discussion with industry.	In use and 100% worth the price as quoted. Allowed meters to rejoin comms hubs as enabled the remote reinstallation of the meter / hub to be quicker and more efficient. Also reduced need for replacement meters.	Issues at implementation but now being used. Cannot provide a figure
MP102 A Nov 2020	Power Outage Alerts triggered by an OTA firmware upgrade	To formalise the agreement within the SEC to ensure that a POA is not generated when an OTA firmware upgrade takes place. Amendments will be made to SMETS2 sections 4.3, 5.4, 5.10 and 5.16. This will ensure that	£0	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Network operators did benefit as it "cut out the noise". Difficult to provide specific numbers. Could be one for performance assurance once established as it is an	-	-



		the obligations are applied to single phase ESME, twin element single phase ESME, poly-phase ESME and Gas Smart Metering Equipment (GSME). The document changes will state that under no circumstances will a smart meter cut the power to a CH for more than three minutes when an OTA firmware upgrade takes place. Once implemented, meter Manufacturers will have to produce Devices that are compliant with the Technical Specifications and will therefore resolve the issue going forwards.			example of addressing a known issue that could be monitored before, during and after the mod to establish how well the problem has been solved. Network Operators hope that performance assurance will pick up more issues like this.		
MP115 Nov 2020	Changes to the NCSC Good Practice Guides	Updating now invalid references	£0	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Housekeeping type change - might need to have a better way of reporting these.	-	-
SECMP007 Nov 2021	Firmware updates to IHDs and PPMIDs	Introduce a way to execute OTA firmware updates to mandated HAN Devices, specifically In-Home Displays (IHDs), Prepayment Meter Interface Devices (PPMIDs) and HAN Connected Auxiliary Load Control Switches (HCALCSs).	£20,100,000	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Example of something that was flagged to DESNZ (or previous equivalent) but they drew a line in the sand. Long drawn-out Mod that required page turning exercise to find all the issues. Not including the requirements meant a	Not using it and don't plan to.	Not operational yet so cannot provide numbers or monetary values at this time. However, it will be used once tests are complete.



					knock-on impact on comms hubs and ability to upgrade SMETS1 to SMETS2. This Mod will improve things, but it should have been included from the start. Not being used yet as it is so expensive and needs testing and working with manufacturers. Not being used as newer kit has become available sooner.		
<u>MP157</u> Nov 2021	Removal of DUIS v1.0 and v2.0	To introduce a Maintenance Validity Period (MVP) for the DUIS Table in the TSAT. This way, the versions of DUIS can be given Maintenance Start dates and Maintenance End dates to highlight which versions of DUIS remain relevant, and to remove older versions of DUIS from the SEC.	£0	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Should have reduced costs over time but how is that demonstrated publicly.		
<u>SECMP 0015</u> Jun 2022	GPF timestamp for reading instantaneous Gas values	To allow Parties and devices reading the instantaneous values from the GPF to know the time on the GSME's clock when the value was provided. This will also allow In Home Displays (IHDs) and	£4,595,044	Due to it being an old mod the benefit section was not introduced back then.	Cost a fortune and still not realising the benefits as the comms hub doesn't support it		



		Pre-Payment Interface Devices (PPMIDs) to determine and display the time of the last updates.					
SECMP0024 June 2022	Enduring Approach to Communication Hub Firmware Management	The Proposed Solution seeks to implement a new DCC Alert that will be sent to Suppliers upon firmware being activated on Communications Hubs. This Alert will contain the Communications Hub firmware version.	£512,003	The Proposer believes that SECMP0024 will better facilitate SEC Objective (a). The SMIP relies on the coordinated involvement of many different Parties. The provision of a CH firmware update framework that is coordinated, controlled and transparent to the relevant parties will facilitate the efficient provision, installation, and operation and interoperability of Smart Metering Systems at Energy Consumers' premises within Great Britain. The new DCC Alert will enable Suppliers to monitor firmware updates to CHs.	Up until this change was delivered suppliers got no notification that upgrades had happened so weren't aware of new capabilities. Getting the alert and are updating their systems saves having to call for it specifically. Useful to pinpoint the date without going through SSI. For a SEC mod it was relatively inexpensive	Useful for triaging. It is used and is helpful but could not put a value on it.	-



MP125 Jun 2023	Correcting Device Information ESME Variant, Device Model, Device Manufacturer	To allow Responsible Supplier to correct the ESME Variant field in the SMI after a Device has been commissioned. The Responsible Supplier shall be able to send SR8.4 'Update Inventory' to correct the ESME Variant if the Device Status is 'Whitelisted', 'Installed Not Commissioned' or 'Commissioned'.	£80,995	The Proposer believes that this modification better facilitates General SEC Objective (a) as it would ensure accurate information was held in the SMI and consumers will be offered the correct tariff.	Have used it and corrected the data of ones they are supplier for. Doing a big reconciliation and this helps to complete it. Relatively inexpensive	That was a fixing stuff one. No direct benefit	There is a benefit – only data accuracy / portfolio management
MP229 June 2023	Notification of material change to User Systems to include decommissioning	To align the SEC to the SCF and improve clarity the SEC will be updated under Section G3.9 to reflect the requirement on Users to notify the SSC when a component of their system is being discontinued or decommissioned.	£0	Reducing the risk of a User's System being decommissioned and introducing issues to either Devices or User Systems that impact consumers. Reducing the chance of potential security defects being introduced to a User's System.	-	-	-



MP222 June 2023	CPL submission efficiency improvements	Introduce additional Message Code and allow the Device Alert sent from an HCALCS Device to be parsed successfully for intended recipients. This modification will also make two minor changes to SEC Appendix AD 'DCC User Interface Specification (DUIS)' for housekeeping and clarification.	£0	The efficiency improvements to the CPL submission process will provide improvements to the provision, operation and interoperability of smart metering systems. Enable fixes and enhancements to consumers' smart meters that will enable them to better manage their energy usage. Means that Manufacturers that are not affiliated with a Supplier will be able to provide firmware and hardware revisions to their Devices.	Has clearly helped as don't have to hunt for a sponsor but difficult to quantify. Certainly speeding things up but cannot provide numbers	-	-
-----------------------	--	---	----	---	---	---	---



MP220 June 2023	MMC Changes resulting from GBCS v4.1 Device Testing	The Proposed Solution is to remove the requirement for a Supplier Party to provide endorsement/approval for a firmware or hardware revision to a SMETS2 Device that is currently listed on the CPL.	£0	Helping to ensure that HICALCS Devices can communicate effectively over the DCC System. Ensure Device Firmware is kept up to date and can be maintained by Suppliers.	-	-	-
MP214 June 2023	Clarification of Acceptable DCC User IDs for Import and Export Suppliers	This modification will allow Parties acting in any combination of some or all of the User Roles 'Import Supplier', 'Export Supplier' and 'Gas Supplier' to use the same DCC ID number.	£0	Improve efficiency for both the DCC and SEC Parties	Legal text only change so good for clarity for impacted suppliers.	-	-
MP215 June 2023	Communications Hub Ordering and Forecasting	The Proposed Solution is to introduce aspects of the Temporary Communications Hub Ordering and Delivery Rules (TCHODR) to the BAU rules governing the forecasting and ordering process for SMETS2+ Communications Hubs.	£0	Reducing risk in the supply chain of Communications Hubs and their critical components allows Device procurement to operate more efficiently and provides assurance to DCC	-	-	-



				Users on stock levels so that they can effectively plan installations. Reducing the allowed variance between initial forecasts and final quantities for Communications Hub orders reduces the risk that the DCC or the CSP will not be able to procure the necessary Device components in the timescales expected of them.			
MP183 June 2023	Post Commissioning Obligations Reporting	The Proposed Solution is to remove the successful execution of Certificate-related Service Requests as a criterion for meeting Post Commissioning Obligations. This data will still be captured in the updated reporting suite, which will show the Certificate health of all Commissioned Devices throughout their lifespan	£0	Provide greater and more accurate detail to DCC Users of Devices which have failed Post Commissioning and the reasons for failure. This will facilitate resolution of incidents and reduce the time and resource spent investigating incidents which	It is used actively – worked on building the report decision. Good collaborative working example	Security sub committee / users = benefit specifically for them. Do look at it for improvement in accuracy.	-



				are currently falsely reported as failures.			
MP128A June 2023	Gas Network Operators SMKI Requirements	The Proposed Solution to this MP128A 'Gas Network Operator SMKI Requirements' is that GNOs must submit a Certificate Revocation Request and replace their Organisation Certificates with Access Control Broker (ACB) Certificates prior to ceasing to be DCC Users.	£0	Ensures remote communication with Devices isn't lost in the event of a change in GNP.	Benefit is not having to update the GNOs – so jobs quicker once retrained. Removes burden of having to keep them up to date. Key benefit on GNOs not having to receive / use the data / access	-	-
MP125 June 2023	Correcting Device Information for the ESME Variant	The Proposed Solution will allow the Responsible Supplier to correct the ESME Variant field in the SMI after a Device has been commissioned. The Responsible Supplier shall be able to send SR8.4 'Update Inventory' to correct the ESME Variant if the Device Status is 'Whitelisted', 'Installed Not Commissioned' or 'Commissioned'.	£81,000	Ensure accurate information was held in the SMI and consumers will be offered the correct tariff.	Have used it and corrected the data of ones they are supplier for. Doing a big reconciliation and this helps to complete it. Relatively inexpensive	That was a fixing stuff one. No direct benefit	There is a benefit – only data accuracy / portfolio management



MP102B June 2023	Power Outage Alerts triggered by an OTA firmware upgrade – enduring solution	The Proposed Solution is for the DSP to build a mechanism that will suppress POAs which may have been caused by a firmware update to L+G ESME Devices.	£197,524	Removing the need for additional traffic on the system that would be associated with additional Service Requests to ascertain the status of the supply at a consumer's premises. There will also be a reduction in DNOs having to contact the consumer via telephone (with the associated cost and use of valuable resource) to understand the situation. The Proposed Solution will also reduce the likelihood of site visits because of the issue identified.	Firmware upgrade caused the alert reduced the noise caused by specific devices	DNO benefit and not using it. Helpful for them and reducing confusion but not benefit to suppliers.	-
------------------------	--	--	----------	---	--	---	---



SECMP0 024 Feb 2024	Enduring Approach to Communication Hub Firmware Management	The Proposed Solution seeks to implement a new DCC Alert that will be sent to Suppliers upon firmware being activated on Communications Hubs. This Alert will contain the Communications Hub firmware version.	£512,003	The new DCC Alert will enable Suppliers to monitor firmware updates to CHs Suppliers could track progress of their pilot CH firmware update rollout, automatically be notified of the new CH firmware version and no longer need to periodically query the SMI. Suppliers will be able to better plan the deployment of firmware updates to other HAN Devices as a result of any CH firmware updates. This could further prevent any HAN stability issues arising The Proposer noted cost savings are difficult to calculate. However, the alternative of not having accurate	-	-	-
--	---	---	-----------------	--	---	---	---



				and quick access to a customer's CH firmware version can lead to poor customer service, longer customer contact times and inefficient asset deployment planning.			
MP122 B (Nov 2023)	Operational Metrics - Part 2	To realise the full set of reporting sought, changes are needed to the DCC Systems and Service Provider contracts. To ensure the reporting elements that did not require these changes could be delivered sooner, the original modification was split into two and progressed under MP122A 'Operational Metrics' . MP122B seeks to progress the DCC System and Service Provider changes to improve reporting on several business processes as well as improve the timeliness of the PMR.	£1,203,871	The Proposer believes that MP122B will facilitate SEC Objective (b) as it will help provide a clear account of the Service that the DCC is providing to ensure that they are compliant with their obligations and SEC Objective (g) by providing clear and relevant reports that will detail exactly what is happening with the DCC Systems and performance. It	Expensive and not used as did not deliver the original ask as gaps in process were not flagged early enough to stop the Mod. MP242 raised as a direct result	Painful going through SEC working group. Not seen a benefit as don't use all of the output. Got watered down as going through the process so not as originally intended then superseded	-



				will also highlight any anomalies that might require addressing.			
<u>MP216</u> (Nov 2023)	Incorporation of Category 2 Issue Resolution Proposals into the SEC – Batch 9	Implementation of these IRPs will ensure Devices operate as they are intended.	£0	The Proposer believes that this modification will better facilitate SEC Objective (a) as the implementation of the IRPs will reduce the risk of future operational issues arising by correcting missing data.	IRPs assume they have to happen. Very technical so really difficult to understand / respond to	Standard things that come through – see them similar to housekeeping	-
<u>MP226</u> (Nov 2023)	Incorporation of Category 3 Issue Resolution Proposals into the SEC - Batch 10	Implementation of these IRPs will ensure Devices operate as they are intended.	£0	The Proposer believes that this modification will better facilitate SEC Objective (a) as the implementation of the IRPs will reduce the risk of future operational issues arising by correcting missing data.	IRPs assume they have to happen. Very technical so really difficult to understand / respond to	Standard things that come through – see them similar to housekeeping	-



MP250 (Nov 2023)	GBCS correction	To correct the SECMP0056-related errors and inconsistencies identified in SEC Schedule 8 'GB Companion Specification'.	£0	The Proposer believes that the modification will better facilitate SEC Objective (a) as it will correct errors in the SEC and lead to less confusion or interpretation.	Document only change – housekeeping	-	-
MP162 (Jun 2024)	SEC changes required to deliver MHHS	MP162 will introduce the changes needed to allow Supplier Agents to be able to collect half-hourly meter readings from ESME for MHHS. The solution will: • Create a new User Role for non-Supplier Parties carrying out the Meter Data Retrieval (MDR) service • Define the Service Requests the MDR User Role will have access to and the associated Target Response Times (TRTs) • Define the User Entry Process requirements for the MDR User Role • Define the associated security arrangements that will apply to the MDR User Role	£4,220,000	Implementing the changes needed to deliver the MDR role defined in the MHHS TOM	Assume benefits are from main MHHS project so will be assessed there.	-	-



MP178 (Jun 2024)	Removing DSP validation against the SMI join status for SR8.8.x	The Proposed Solution will remove the Data Service Provider (DSP) validation of Join status in the SMI when sending an Unjoin Service Request. This will allow the processing of unjoin commands irrespective of the join status held in the SMI.	£40,404.00	It is less likely to have issues on Devices when being commissioned. This will increase the instances of smart functionality and benefits of smart features to consumers.	Has had benefits for suppliers. Previously DSP would have stopped the request to the asset. This mod is a lot better for suppliers as don't have orphaned assets. Use it every day.	-	-
MP256 (Jun 2024)	SEC Alignment with DCC SMETS1 MHHS Capacity Requirements	To minimise the impact of MHHS on S1SPs, SMETS1 WAN Providers, and the DCO, the DCC will implement a short-lived (up to 25 hours) secure data cache of the response data at the S1SP.	£0	Consumers with SMETS1 Devices would be unable to take advantage of new tariffs if DCC capacity is insufficient to support increased Service Request requirements for MHHS.	Assume benefits are from main MHHS project so will be assessed there.	-	-
MP269 (Jun 2024)	June 2024 SEC Release Supporting Changes	The Proposed Solution clarifies the changes required to the legal text of MP256 to reflect the DCC design. The legal text changes will affect SEC Appendix AM 'SMETS1 Supporting Requirements'.	£0	For DCC to comply with the obligations under the MHHS Programme including ensuring sufficient capacity for the increased volume of SRs.	Document only change	-	-



SECMP0 028 (Nov 2024)	Prioritising Service Requests	In order to reduce potential impacts on Consumers, the Proposer suggests adding a priority ranking to each System message. During periods of high message volumes, were a queue to form, this would result in the DCC processing higher priority messages first.	£309,879	Prioritising consumer driven messages and reducing the risk of Prepayment consumers being off supply unnecessarily. Avoid reputational damage.	Question on has this delivered what was expected. Possibly needs a full review but might be too early to say.	Not a benefit as don't have a PPM portfolio. This should be quantifiable as should be able to see top ups coming back more quickly. Could say the same for other Mods.	-
MP253	Traffic Management for Price Cap Update Events – User Actions Required	This modification proposes to introduce an obligation into the SEC requiring DCC Users to follow instructions established by the DCC during a Price Cap Update Event.	£0	Managing DCC Total System traffic and reducing demand. This includes the re-submission of failed or expired messages.	Now there are expectations (not obligations) – it has helped industry as a whole – impact of 1 party on the industry greatly reduced.	-	-
MP270	Enabling DCC to provide SMDA Test House services	The Proposed Solution will introduce clarifying terms in the SEC that would allow the DCC to carry out SMDA testing, provided it is awarded the contract.	£0	Allow DCC to potentially provide future SMDA testing services and remain compliant with its obligations should the company be awarded the SMDA Testing Service contract.	Unclear who actually benefited as both suppliers and manufacturer saw none	-	-

